

SECTION 6.0

CUMULATIVE IMPACTS

6.1 INTRODUCTION/PURPOSE

In many cases, the impact of a single project may not be significant, but when combined with other projects, the “cumulative” impact may be significant. Section 15355 of the CEQA Guidelines defines “cumulative impacts” as two or more individual effects which, when considered together, are considerable or which compound or increase other environmental impacts.” CEQA Guidelines Section 15130(b) states that “the discussion [of cumulative impacts] need not provide as great of detail as is provided of the effects attributable to the project alone.” Section 15130(b) further states that a cumulative impacts discussion should be guided by the standards of practicality and reasonableness.

Cumulative impacts can occur from the interactive effects of a single project. For example, the combination of noise and dust generated during construction activities can be additive and can have a greater impact than either noise or dust alone. However, substantial cumulative impacts more often result from the combined effect of past, present and future projects that are located in proximity to the project under review. For example, the wastewater treatment demand generated by a project may not be significant when analyzed alone, however, when analyzed in combination with the wastewater demands of approved or proposed projects, the wastewater demands may exceed the resource capabilities of the service agency, resulting in a significant cumulative impact. Therefore, it is important for a cumulative impacts analysis to be viewed over time and in conjunction with other related past, present and reasonably foreseeable future developments which may have impacts that might compound or interrelate with those of the project under review.

6.2 CUMULATIVE FORECASTING METHODOLOGY

Section 15130 (b)(1)(A) of the CEQA Guidelines allows for the preparation of a list of past, present, and reasonably anticipated future project as a viable method of determining cumulative impacts. This discussion utilizes that approach. An initial list and description of all related projects is provided followed by a discussion of the effects that the proposed project combined with the list may have on each environmental category of concern. Consistent with CEQA, this discussion is guided by the standards of practicality and reasonableness.

6.3 LIST OF RELATED PROJECTS

This section of the analysis provides a list of past, present, and reasonably foreseeable future projects. Several development proposals and City projects have been submitted for consideration or have been recently approved in proximity to the proposed project that together with the proposed project would result in an increase in construction-related environmental impacts. To analyze cumulative impacts, the greater EastLake area will serve as the study area. The greater EastLake area consists of the land uses along the future alignment of SR-125, along Wueste Road, Otay Lakes Road and Olympic Parkway. The location of each project described below is depicted on *Figure 6-1, Cumulative Projects*.

Bonita Long Canyon. This existing development includes 341 single-family homes, 153 multi-family homes, an open space preserve, senior high school and local commercial uses.

Bonita Meadows. Bonita Meadows is planned to be a 300-single family home development.

EastLake Business Center I and II. The EastLake Business Center I and II includes the development of 185 acres of industrial park and light industry, offices, a park and a fire or police station.

EastLake Panhandle. Future development of this site may include up to 90 dwelling units on 45 acres.

EastLake Trails and EastLake Greens. The EastLake Trails/Greens is located within the EastLake II GDP. These areas include development of 2,788 single-family and 2,100 multi-family residences. In addition, a senior high school, 2 elementary schools and a 158-acre golf course are planned. Land uses also include community commercial, freeway commercial, public and private neighborhood parks, offices, religious and community facilities.

EastLake Woods and EastLake Vistas. The EastLake Woods and Vistas projects include development of 2,061 dwelling units on 492 acres. Both developments will accommodate a mixture of both low-density and high-density residential uses. The Woods Parcel will include public facilities such as an elementary school, junior high school, fire station and recreation area. The Vistas parcel will include commercial and public park land uses in addition to residential development. The proposed project is technically a part of the Vistas Parcel.

Figure 6-1 Cumulative Projects

EastLake Land Swap Parcels. The Land Swap Parcels are planned for commercial and residential development. The Northern parcel would be 24.7 acres of Professional and Administrative Commercial uses and the southern parcel would be used for Freeway Commercial and Medium/High density residential use. This would expand R-9 from 8.5 acres to 65 acres. Densities would also increase from 5.3 dwellings/acre to 11.5 dwellings/acre. The expected result would be 750 units for the residential portion of the southern parcel.

Olympic Training Center. The Olympic Training Center is a master planned facility dedicated to the development of U.S. Olympic athletes. The facility supports many sports, including archery, bobsledding, canoeing/kayaking, cycling, field hockey, luge, rowing, rugby, skiing/snowboarding, soccer, softball, triathlon, and various Paralympic sports. The 155-acre complex accommodates approximately 4,000 athletes a year live and train at the facility. The site also provides housing and dining opportunities for athletes, offices, laboratories, meeting rooms, parking and storage. The Olympic Training Center is planned for 300 multi-family units.

Otay Ranch Master Planned Community. The Otay Ranch is a master planned community consisting of approximately 23,000 acres. At build-out of the community, over 20,000 new residences will be built. The Otay Ranch is planned in a series of “villages” with each village containing a village core where densities and intensity of use are concentrated. Land uses disperse from the village cores, and open spaces, including public parks and trails, separate the villages from one another. A key component of the master plan design is the ability to accommodate light rail transit when such facilities can be extended to this area. The Otay Ranch is located to the west of the proposed project.

Otay Ranch Village 13 Resort Site. The Village 13 project area of Otay Ranch comprises approximately 1,870 acres located in an unincorporated portion of the County and is designated for a resort development and open space. Village 13 include 1,843 single-family and 277 multi-family dwelling units and the proposed resort would include hotel, restaurants, health spa, fitness center, and resort villas and townhomes.

Rancho Del Rey I and II. The Rancho Del Rey I and II development contains 2,535 single-family and 148 multi-family homes, community and commercial uses, parks, a community purpose facility, and a 20-acre junior high/middle school.

Rancho Del Rey III. The Rancho Del Rey III development incorporates 2,512 single-family and 298 multi-family homes in addition to a park, open space area and 26-acre junior high/middle school.

Rolling Hills Ranch. Rolling Hills Ranch is a planned community proposing 2,099 single-family homes and 2,100 multi-family homes, a high school, two elementary schools, golf course,

community and freeway commercial uses, public and private parks, offices, religious and community facility buildings.

SR-125 Extension. The SR-125 Extension project would consist of an 11-mile highway alignment from I-905 near the International Border to SR-54 near Sweetwater Reservoir. Completion of this project would provide for connection to the only commercial port of entry in San Diego to the regional freeway network. Completion of SR-125 is anticipated in 2007.

Salt Creek I. Salt Creek I is a developed community with 163 single-family homes and 377 multi-family homes.

San Miguel Ranch. San Miguel Ranch is a planned community under construction with a total of 1,394 single-family homes and 14 acres of commercial uses.

Sunbow SPA Plan. The Sunbow development includes 1,382 single-family and 1,073 multi-family dwelling units. The plan also included a park, elementary school, commercial and industrial uses, a 28-acre hospital site and 176 acres of open space.

Telegraph Canyon Estate. Telegraph Canyon Estate is a developed neighborhood which included the construction of 344 single-family units. The development is located to the west of the Eastlake Village Center and west of the future SR-125 alignment.

Terra Nova. The Terra Nova development includes 529 single-family and 739 multi-family units, a church, elementary school, neighborhood park and community commercial uses. One hundred forty acres of the Terra Nova development is preserved in open space.

Vista Mother Miguel. Vista Mother Miguel is a 40 unit development of single-family homes.

6.4 IMPACTS TO ENVIRONMENTAL FACTORS

Because this EIR tiers from FSEIR #01-01 cumulative impacts identified in that previous EIR are summarized below. Similar to the analysis in Section 5.0, an analysis of the proposed project's cumulative impacts follows the FSEIR #01-01 summary of cumulative impacts.

Land Use Planning and Zoning

FSEIR #01-01 stated that development that is consistent with the approved plans would not result in any additional cumulative land use impacts. A significant land use impact would not occur as long as basic planning principles are achieved. FSEIR #01-01 concluded that the

development of the EastLake III Woods and Vistas parcels would generally be consistent with and thus achieve the same basic planning principles as the City General Plan and General Development Plan for EastLake III proposed at that time. The loss of agricultural land associated with project development is a cumulative impact, however, it is not considered cumulatively significant or cumulatively considerable because the land proposed for development is neither prime agricultural land nor zoned for agricultural use.

Although the proposed EastLake III Senior Housing project would require a General Plan Amendment, and amendments to the EastLake III GDP and SPA, the change in land use from commercial tourist to high-density residential senior housing would not introduce a land use that would be incompatible with the surrounding mixture of commercial, quasi-public and residential uses. The change in land use would also not create a significant cumulative loss of commercial tourist use. Several other locations in eastern Chula Vista are planned for resort/hotel uses, including the Otay Ranch Village 13 and Eastern Urban Center. Both sites are located within 2.5 miles of the site and could accommodate the visitors to eastern Chula Vista. Lastly, the proposed project in conjunction with the buildout of other areas of Chula Vista will contribute to the conversion of vacant land to urban uses in the eastern area of Chula Vista. However, the site is planned for development, and is one of the last planned development parcels in the EastLake III Vistas community. Further, the project site is surrounded by development, and services are provided to the site. As such, the proposed project would be considered an “infill” development, would not extend services or promote growth where none is currently planned, and would not result in a cumulative loss of vacant land. The conversion of vacant land to residential uses and change in land use from commercial tourist to high density senior housing is not considered cumulatively significant.

Landform Alteration and Aesthetics

FSEIR #01-01 states that the City of Chula Vista General Plan, EastLake III General Development Plan and General Development Plan EIR anticipated the components of the EastLake III project. Open expanses of rolling hills used for agricultural purposes would be developed with clustered residential and commercial areas separated by open space. Consistent with other EIRs, a significant unmitigable cumulative impact associated with landform alteration and change in visual character was identified. . The Chula Vista City Council adopted a Statement of Overriding Considerations for this impact.

Because the proposed project’s environmental analysis is tiered from FSEIR #01-01, this significant cumulative impact related to landform alteration and aesthetics must be carried forward in this document for the decision makers’ review.

The proposed project will contribute to the change in visual character of the Lower Otay Reservoir area. While the project site has been graded and is no longer natural open space, it is an undeveloped vacant site. The proposed project would incrementally contribute to the developed, suburban nature of the western rim of the Lower Otay Reservoir. These visual changes will be most evident from the Lower Otay Reservoir, Olympic Parkway and Wueste Road. In conjunction with other existing, developing or planned developments, the project's contribution to the loss of open space would represent a cumulative impact. The mitigation for the project impacts would be applicable for cumulative impacts to landform alteration and visual quality associated with the proposed project. That said, this impact would remain significant and unmitigable.

Biological Resources

FSEIR #01-01 concluded that given the predominance of agricultural land and lack of sensitive vegetation on the EastLake III project site, the project's contribution to cumulative biological impacts would not be considered significant. The cumulative loss of sensitive habitats from the project and other cumulative projects within the City is addressed in the MSCP and the City's Subarea Plan which was intended to provide the City with a comprehensive plan for preservation of key biological resources while allowing remaining areas to be developed.

Development of this project, combined with the others described above, would contribute to the increase in human presence within the eastern Chula Vista area. Continued development within the eastern areas of Chula Vista and the extension of SR-125 would extend urban land uses into vacant areas characterized by natural habitats and utilized by the region's sensitive plant and wildlife species. As indicated in FSEIR #01-01, approval of the MSCP and the City's Subarea Plan was intended to mitigate for the cumulative loss of sensitive biological resources in Chula Vista. The project is consistent with the MSCP and City's Subarea Plan. Therefore, the proposed project, combined with existing, developing or planned projects would not result in cumulative biological resource impacts.

Geology and Soils

FSEIR #01-01 did not discuss cumulative impacts related to geology and soil conditions.

Geology and soil hazards associated with development on surrounding projects would be site-specific and can be mitigated on a project-by-project basis. The project would not involve the pumping or depletion of groundwater resources, which would have the potential to result in cumulative impacts to groundwater resources and soil stability. Therefore, no significant cumulative impacts related to geology and soil resources would occur.

Water Quality and Hydrology

FSEIR #01-01 concluded that cumulative impacts to Otay Lakes Basin and the Salt Creek Drainage Basin would occur as a result of development of the EastLake III GDP and SPA Plan. These impacts would be related to the potential for more channel and soil erosion into the downstream areas. Increased erosion could negatively impact downstream water quality. To reduce hydrological impacts to the Otay Lakes Basin, the master drainage system was designed to divert surface flows from 243 acres to the Salt Creek Basin. Incorporation of this design feature along with several Best Management Practices were determined to reduce potential significant cumulative impacts to water quality and hydrology to a level below significant.

Runoff from project development areas, including surface parking lots and landscaped areas will contribute to the incremental increase in urban runoff to the Otay River system. However, the proposed project site currently drains to an existing storm drain system that funnels site drainage to the Salt Creek Drainage Basin to avoid discharge into the Otay Reservoirs. The proposed project would not alter this drainage pattern. Further, the project would implement Best Management Practices to maintain water quality in the Salt Creek Drainage Basin. All drainage that leaves the project site would be filtered through mechanisms designed to trap pollutants which would eliminate the project's regional contribution to cumulative water quality issues.. In compliance with City thresholds, onsite runoff will not exceed pre-development volumes. The project's compliance with applicable federal, state and city regulations for stormwater and construction discharges, including the application of Best Management Practices, would reduce the project's contribution to cumulative impacts to water quality to a level below significance.

Transportation, Circulation and Access

FSEIR #01-01 concluded that significant cumulative traffic circulation impacts at project area intersections, street segments and freeway operations would occur through the years 2005, 2010, 2015, 2020 and at build-out. Impacts to freeway operations at I-805 would remain significant and unmitigable. The Chula Vista City Council adopted a Statement of Overriding Considerations for this impact.

Because the proposed project's environmental analysis is tiered from FSEIR 01-01, this significant cumulative impact related to transportation and circulation must be carried forward in this document for the decision makers' review.

As discussed in *Section 5.0*, the proposed project would contribute 1,684 average daily trips less than assumed for the site under the existing land use designation and as addressed in FSEIR #01-01. The traffic analysis for the proposed project concluded that, in and of itself, the proposed

project would not result in a significant contribution to traffic on I-805 and would not result in a sufficient contribution to regional road network to warrant a cumulative impact. The only traffic impact identified was project specific. However, because the proposed project is part of the buildout of the overall EastLake III community, a significant cumulative unmitigable traffic impact was identified for buildout of the community, and the proposed project would result in an incremental contribution to the traffic from buildout of the community, a significant cumulative unmitigated traffic impact is identified.

Air Quality

FSEIR #01-01 concluded that development of the EastLake III community will result in significant, unmitigable air quality impacts. Compliance with regional air pollution rules and regulations will reduce potential short-term impacts related to construction, however will not completely mitigate for them. Project operations-related impacts, including those related to stationary and mobile sources are projected to exceed South Coast Air Quality Management District thresholds and would therefore result in significant regional air quality impacts. Therefore, significant unmitigable cumulative air quality impacts would occur as a result of buildout of EastLake III. The Chula Vista City Council adopted a Statement of Overriding Considerations for this impact.

Implementation of the proposed project would result in short-term impacts to air quality associated with construction and long-term impacts associated with increased vehicle traffic. The cumulative effect of the proposed project and other projects in the vicinity would incrementally contribute to the San Diego Air Basin's levels of PM-10, ROG, NO_x, CO, O₃ and SO₂. Dust control measures implemented during grading operations would be regulated in accordance with the rules and regulations of the County of San Diego Air Pollution Control District (APCD) and the California Air Resources Board, and, on a project level, not exceed thresholds. However, the San Diego Air Basin is currently in non-attainment status for both federal and state requirements for O₃ and state requirements of PM-10; therefore, any emissions would contribute to a significant impact. While the proposed project would generate less than half of the projected traffic for the site under the existing land use designation, it would still contribute incrementally to overall cumulative vehicular emissions generated by buildout of the area. Therefore, the proposed project would contribute to the significant cumulative air quality impacts which are not be fully mitigable on a project-by-project basis.

Noise

FSEIR #01-01 states that ambient noise levels in the project area would increase as a result of new urban activities. Cumulative noise levels from EastLake III and other development in the

Eastern Territories would not exceed land use compatibility standards if mitigation measures for impacts associated with development on a project-by-project basis are incorporated.

Cumulative noise impacts are discussed in terms of traffic-related noise and a general increase in urbanization in an area. A project's contribution to cumulative traffic noise would be evaluated on a project-by-project basis, and if significant impacts are identified (e.g., non-compliance with noise standards) then mitigation requirements would be imposed. As described in *Section 5.7, Noise*, anticipated interior noise levels warrant mitigation to reduce impacts to less than significant due to the proximity of Olympic Parkway and anticipated traffic levels along this roadway. Once built, the project will contribute to the overall increase in ambient noise, however similar to the conclusion described in FSEIR #01-01 for the entire EastLake III community, because the project and other projects' noise levels within the area would not exceed land use compatibility standards, cumulative noise impacts would not occur.

Public Services and Utilities

FSEIR #01-01 analyzed cumulative impacts to water supply and sewer service. FSEIR #01-01 states that development of the EastLake III project would incrementally increase regional water consumption, however this increase represents a less than significant impact given current water availability. Further, this increase in water demand has been planned for within the City of Chula Vista.

FSEIR #01-01 indicates that development of the Woods and Vistas would incrementally reduce the capacity in the Point Loma Metro Sewer System. However, because the Metro system has the capacity to accommodate future planned growth, the increased flows would not be cumulatively significant. FSEIR #01-01 also noted the potential for increased sewer demand to overwhelm the City's sewer infrastructure. Mitigation was contemplated and has largely been completed to help convey flows within the City's system prior to its entrance into the Metro facilities.

The project would involve an incremental increase in demand for public facilities. However, this demand has been planned for by the City of Chula Vista. Sewer and water services are already provided to the site, and the associated infrastructure is adequately sized to accommodate the sewage generation and water demand. OWD has indicated that water supplies are available for the proposed development. Because other projects considered as part of this cumulative analysis would also be required to demonstrate sewer service and water availability, cumulative impacts to sewer and water services would not be significant.

The proposed project would similarly increase demand on police protection and fire and emergency services. The PFFP that has been prepared for the project addresses the need for additional police services and recommends methods to maintain acceptable service levels. The City will evaluate each project considered as part of this cumulative analysis on a similar level, and each project will be required to pay fees to offset incremental increases in demand created by the project. Therefore, cumulative impacts to law enforcement and fire protection are not considered significant.

While the project is an age restricted facility, it may contribute to the cumulative need for additional school facilities. The proposed project, as well as foreseeable future projects, will be required to pay school fees to pay for school services and improvements commensurate with need. Therefore, impacts to schools would not be considered significant.

The proposed project would create a demand for library services to serve its residents, and, when considered with past, present and future developments, the project would contribute an incremental demand on libraries. However, the project would pay development fees that would be used towards library facilities within the City, in accordance with the City's Growth Management Ordinance. Other projects considered as part of this cumulative impact analysis would also be required to contribute development fees, as necessary to offset incremental demand for library services. Therefore, cumulative impacts to libraries would not be significant.

Buildout of the proposed project in conjunction with the cumulative projects analyzed in this analysis would increase the amount of solid waste generated within the region. As indicated in *Section 5.8*, the Otay Landfill has sufficient capacity to accommodate the proposed project. Additionally, the project, as well as other foreseeable future projects, would implement programs and policies related to solid waste management and a recycling program. As a result, no significant cumulative solid waste impacts would occur.

Paleontological Resources

FSEIR #01-01 concluded that the EastLake III area contains significant paleontological resources. Fossils were recovered from the underlying Otay and Sweetwater Formations in previous EastLake construction and represent significant contributions to California paleontology. This EIR indicates that the presence of monitors during construction will eliminate paleontological impacts on a project-by-project basis.

Monitoring for paleontological resources already occurred during grading of the site in 2002. However, the proposed project may excavate below previously disturbed formation for the subterranean parking. Therefore, this project may contribute to cumulative impacts to

paleontological resources during construction of the underground parking. This cumulative impact will be mitigated through project-specific mitigation measures.